SINO-PLATONIC PAPERS

Number 41

October, 1993

Miching Mallecho: The Zhanguo ce and Classical Rhetoric

by Paul Rakita Goldin

Victor H. Mair, Editor
Sino-Platonic Papers

Department of East Asian Languages and Civilizations
University of Pennsylvania
Philadelphia, PA 19104-6305 USA
vmair@sas.upenn.edu
www.sino-platonic.org

SINO-PLATONIC PAPERS is an occasional series edited by Victor H. Mair. The purpose of the series is to make available to specialists and the interested public the results of research that, because of its unconventional or controversial nature, might otherwise go unpublished. The editor actively encourages younger, not yet well established, scholars and independent authors to submit manuscripts for consideration. Contributions in any of the major scholarly languages of the world, including Romanized Modern Standard Mandarin (MSM) and Japanese, are acceptable. In special circumstances, papers written in one of the Sinitic topolects (fangyan) may be considered for publication.

Although the chief focus of *Sino-Platonic Papers* is on the intercultural relations of China with other peoples, challenging and creative studies on a wide variety of philological subjects will be entertained. This series is **not** the place for safe, sober, and stodgy presentations. *Sino-Platonic Papers* prefers lively work that, while taking reasonable risks to advance the field, capitalizes on brilliant new insights into the development of civilization.

The only style-sheet we honor is that of consistency. Where possible, we prefer the usages of the *Journal of Asian Studies*. Sinographs (*hanzi*, also called tetragraphs [*fangkuaizi*]) and other unusual symbols should be kept to an absolute minimum. *Sino-Platonic Papers* emphasizes substance over form.

Submissions are regularly sent out to be refereed and extensive editorial suggestions for revision may be offered. Manuscripts should be double-spaced with wide margins and submitted in duplicate. A set of "Instructions for Authors" may be obtained by contacting the editor.

Ideally, the final draft should be a neat, clear camera-ready copy with high blackand-white contrast. Contributors who prepare acceptable camera-ready copy will be provided with 25 free copies of the printed work. All others will receive 5 copies.

Sino-Platonic Papers is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs 2.5 License. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/2.5/ or send a letter to Creative Commons, 543 Howard Street, 5th Floor, San Francisco, California, 94105, USA.

Please note: When the editor goes on an expedition or research trip, all operations (including filling orders) may temporarily cease for up to two or three months at a time. In such circumstances, those who wish to purchase various issues of *SPP* are requested to wait patiently until he returns. If issues are urgently needed while the editor is away, they may be requested through Interlibrary Loan.

N.B.: Beginning with issue no. 171, *Sino-Platonic Papers* will be published electronically on the Web. Issues from no. 1 to no. 170, however, will continue to be sold as paper copies until our stock runs out, after which they too will be made available on the Web.

Sino-Platonic Papers, No. 41 (October, 1993)

1

Miching Mallecho: The Zhanguoce and Classical Rhetoric

Ophelia: What means this, my lord?

Hamlet: Marry, this is miching mallecho, it means mischief.

Hamlet, III.ii.136-8.

A consensus regarding the proper classification of the Zhanguoce (Intrigues of the Warring States), the singular collection of anecdotes compiled by the bibliophile Liu Xiang (77-6 B.C.), continues to elude scholars. Henri Maspero has demonstrated that much of the material in the Intrigues is fictional, and historians have since rejected them as a primary source of information, although we know from the work of Zheng Liangshu that they may be derived from many of the same sources which Sima Qian (146-86 B.C.) used for his Shiji (Records of the Historian). Some writers, such as Timoteus Pokora, have found that "much information given en passant in what may perhaps be called informatory parts of the Chan-kuo Ts'e can be corroborated from other sources." Still, it is generally agreed that the Intrigues are very unreliable as a historical text, and probably were never intended as one.

^{1. &}quot;Miching" is the present participle of the obsolete verb "to miche," meaning "to hide," or "to pilfer"--probably related to Modern German meuch-, as in Meuchelmord ("assassination") and meuchlings ("stealthily"). "Mallecho" is likely the Spanish word malhecho, or "misdeed." "Miching mallecho" thus means "secretive malefaction"--or "intrigue."

^{2.} Romanizations of all Chinese characters will be found in the appended glossary.

^{3. &}quot;Le Roman de Sou Ts'in," *Etudes Asiatiques* 2 (1925), 127-41; and "Le Roman historique dans la littérature chinoise de l'antiquité," in *Mélanges Posthumes* (Paris: Civilisations du Sud, 1950), III, 52-62.

^{4.} Zhanguoce yanjiu (Singapore: Xueshu chubanshe, 1972).

^{5. &}quot;Pre-Han literature," in *Essays on the Sources for Chinese History*, ed. Donald D. Leslie, Colin Mackerras, and Gungwu Wang (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1975), 28.

Others see the *Intrigues* as a handbook on persuasive speaking, filled with numerous debates and speeches that serve as examples of superior rhetoric. Yet there does not seem to be a conscious attempt to divide the various items by style or theme. The anecdotes are ordered only by state of provenance, and at that quite loosely. After reading the book, the reader senses that he has been made privy to several gems of rhetorical strategy to be used when the appropriate situation should arise, but has learned nothing of a unified theory of rhetoric that would help him modify his speech to suit all occasions.

By contrast, the more influential of the classical Western handbooks on rhetoric--such as *De oratore*, by Marcus Tullius Cicero (106-43 B.C.); the anonymous *Rhetorica ad Herennium*, and *On Composition*, by Dionysius of Halicarnassos (54-7 B.C.?)--share the advantage of clear organization: their discussions and examples are arranged by topic into different sections. A primer should be coherent and lead the student's mind directly to the points it wishes to convey. But the *Intrigues*, though they may be valuable as something else, are inadequate as a sort of textbook, since none of the rhetorical skills appearing in the speeches are ever discussed analytically, or even identified explicitly, in the text.

The most prominent Western scholar in the study of the *Intrigues* is James I. Crump, Jr., whose critical works and translation of the entire text stand out as fundamental contributions. 7 Crump's own interpretation of the

^{6.} E.g. Burton Watson, *Early Chinese Literature* (New York and London: Columbia University Press, 1962), 75.

^{7.} See esp. "The Chan-kuo Ts'e and its Fiction," T'oung Pao 47.4-5 (1960), 305-75; Intrigues: Studies of the Chan-kuo Ts'e (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1964); and his translation (Chan-Kuo Ts'e, 2nd edition, Chinese Materials and Research Aids Service Center Occasional Series 41 [San Francisco: Chinese Materials Center, 1979]).

Intrigues is encapsulated in the following paragraph:

Suppose a Chinese rhetorical tradition included some such device as the suasoria for training men in the art of persuasion; would that not explain much of what is most baffling about the *Intrigues*? If exercises by the masters or the disciples of such a "school" were part of the "school's" heritage it would not only explain many of the contradictions in the *Intrigues*, but it would account for many other facets of this delightful work. Why, for example, do so many persuaders so often speak their entire piece with no interruption from the ruler, who simply says "so be it" when the persuader is finished? Why are the pieces in the *Intrigues* so beautifully polished? ... These become understandable if the training a man underwent to pursue the career he hoped for (political advisor, emissary, and the like) included model advice which would or should have been offered at certain historic occasions, and somehow found its way into what we now call the *Intrigues of the Warring States*.

This is the first formulation of a theory that has since gained widespread popularity. David Hawkes, for example, agrees wholeheartedly in his review of Crump's book, adding: "It is even arguable that Chan-kuo Ts'e meant not Intrigues of the Warring States [but] Imaginary Speeches on Warring States Themes." More recently, Jean-Paul Reding has called the Intrigues "une vaste collection de pièces rhétoriques, des exercises d'école sans doute." Jaroslav Průšek's is the most significant dissenting voice; he remarks that the "stress on the anecdotal aspect is not by any means subordinated to the stress on rhetoric." Yet neither Crump's supporters nor his critics have studied the tradition of the Roman suasoria and compared it with the rhetoric of the Intrigues. It is just such an examination that we need to undertake before we can gain our own understanding and appreciation of

^{8.} Intrigues, 103f.

^{9.} Journal of the American Oriental Society 86.1 (1966), 63.

^{10.} Les fondements philosophiques de la rhétorique chez les sophistes Grecs et chez les sophistes Chinois (Berne: Peter Lang, 1985), 341.

^{11. &}quot;A New Exegesis of Chan-Kuo-Ts'e," Archiv Orientální 34.4 (1966), 590.

the book. This will involve a comparison of several aspects of Chinese and Roman rhetoric, such as the use of language and devices, as well as the theory of rhetoric and its ultimate goal. What are suasoriae, and why are they relevant to the *Intrigues*? Are the *Intrigues* rhetoric at all?

Suasoriae were Roman school exercises: pupils were given a well-known historical event and required to write persuasive speeches that the personages involved may have delivered. If a contemporary high school student were asked to write his or her own version of George Washington's address at Valley Forge, this assignment would be similar in spirit to the suasoriae of ancient times. Suasoriae are also considered a sub-class of prosopopoeiae, speeches in which a later writer "supplies the words which someone else, real or fictitious, might in agreement with the laws of necessity and probability have composed and delivered under a given set of circumstances." 12

Suasoriae are not rare. The most extensive anthology extant is comprised of the exercises of the students of Seneca the Elder (Lucius Annaeus Seneca, 54 B.C.-A.D. 39?). Others are given by Philostratus the Athenian (ca. 170-245) in his Lives of the Sophists, and in the third part of the aforementioned ad Herennium. Quintilian (Marcus Fabius Quintilianus, d. ca. A.D. 100) discusses them at length in his Institutio Oratoria. Furthermore, in their Satires, Juvenal (Decimus Iunius Iuvenalis, d. ca. A.D. 140) and Persius (Aulus Persius Flaccus, A.D. 34-62) both remember with disdain the days they spent as schoolboys composing suasoriae. 13

In what respects is the comparison between the suasoriae and the Intrigues appropriate? How may it be useful; how may it be misleading?

^{12.} Donald Lemen Clark, *Rhetoric in Greco-Roman Education* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1957), 219.

^{13.} Juvenal I.16; Persius III.45.

Certainly the *Intrigues* may be fairly categorized as prosopopoeiae. They contain too many internal contradictions, both factual and chronological, to be true history. It is more likely that all the words spoken by the kings, the heirs, the courtiers and ministers—in short, by all the characters in the text—are merely the author's imaginative conjectures as to what these people may have said in certain historical situations. For example, the well—known disagreement between Sima Cuo and Zhang Yi over where their state, Qin, should attack (3.13a-14b; 3.161-90; 57)¹⁴—a meaningful historical debate, in Han times—is the prosopopoeia of a later writer. This is why historians can claim to find a kernel of truth in the *Intrigues*: its author or authors deliberately chose actual events to embroider. The text was not intended as a genuine history book, but as historical fiction or a romanticization of history.

But a prosopopoeia is not necessarily a suasoria. Suasoriae constitute a genre that is a peculiar outcropping of classical Roman culture. To get

^{14.} Citations from the *Intrigues* will include three references. The first is to the well-distributed *Sibu congkan* edition; the second is to Zhu Zugeng's excellent critical edition (*Zhanguoce jizhu huikao*, 3 vols. [Nanjing: Jiangsu guji chubanshe, 1985]); the third is the item number in Crump's English translation. Where the texts are inconsistent I will follow Zhu Zugeng.

Several indices to the *Intrigues* exist; these include *Index du Tchan Kouo Ts'ö* (Peking: Centre d'études sinologiques de Pekin, 1948); Sharon J. Fidler, with J.I. Crump, *Index to the Chan-kuo Ts'e* (Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies, 1974)—an index to the first edition of Crump's translation (Oxford: Clarendon, 1970), later incorporated at the end of the revised edition; and the personal and place—name indices at the end of the last volume of Zhu's edition.

There are two important studies of the *Intrigues* not directly relevant to our discussion. These are Zhong Fengnian, *Guoce kanyan*, Yenching Journal of Chinese Studies Monograph Series 11 (Peiping: Harvard-Yenching Institute, 1936), which studies the contents of the various editions and includes a thorough discussion of errors; and K.V. Vasil'ev, *Plany sražajuščichsja cerstv* (Moscow: Nauka, 1968), which considers the value of the text for the economic historian, as well as its place in the peculiar periodization of Chinese literature characteristic of Soviet Sinology of that age. The latter book is reviewed by Pokora in *T'oung Pao* 55.4-5 (1969), 317-22.

ahead in Rome meant to speak well—and that required complete mastery of the complex rhetorical conventions of the day. Roman schoolmasters were aware that the stylized—"fulsome," to use Crump's word¹⁵—use of language that characterized the successful orator was an art acquired only through intensive practice. The suasoriae, which offered an almost infinite selection of exciting historical situations to recreate, were the solution to the particularly Roman problem of training youths to become competent statesmen in the classical mold. But removing the suasoriae from their unique context is problematic. It may be unjustifiable to speak of suasoriae in China at all, since the conditions that arose in Rome may not have arisen elsewhere. Why is Crump's proposition any different from what he calls other "facile analogies from the West?" 18

The different political contexts in which the *Intrigues* and the suasoriae flourished have played a crucial and perhaps understudied role in shaping the two forms. In Rome, the purpose of rhetoric was to persuade whole masses of people, in the Forum or in the Senate. It followed that the most popular and most successful rhetorical devices were those which were effective at swaying bodies or groups of people. These were the techniques that students practiced in their suasoriae. But the situation was quite the opposite in Warring-States China, where the final arbiter was the king alone. A minister who wanted to press his agenda needed above all to convince the sovereign, whose approval was required for any action. This is why most of the arguments found in the *Intrigues* are tailored to persuade a single personage of absolute authority. The basic difference in the purpose and

^{15.} *Intrigues*, 100.

^{16.} Intrigues, 97.

intended audience of Chinese and Roman rhetoric should have a profound effect on the structure of the speeches and choice of devices in the *Intrigues* and the suasoriae.

Nevertheless, although Crump concedes that there are some "obvious exceptions" where his theory is not applicable, in those pieces in the Intrigues for which the analogy with suasoriae may be suitable, there are some remarkable similarities between the two forms. For example, the following thoughts on the suasoriae, given by the Roman orator Quintilian, would be equally appropriate with regard to the Intrigues:

Thus [in a suasoria] nothing is asked other than what is best, and vice versa [i.e. what is the lesser of two evils]. And never does there occur in this type of material a dispute over a matter which is in every respect in our favor; for where there is no place for contradiction, what cause can there be for dispute? Thus almost every suasoria is nothing other than a comparison, and it must be seen what we would obtain and by what means, so that it can be judged whether there be more advantage in that which we seek, or indeed disadvantage in that by which we seek it. 18

One of the most readily identifiable traits of the *Intrigues* is precisely the sort of "comparison" of opposed arguments that Quintilian claims characterizes the suasoriae. Let us consider, for example, the following debate:

Marquis Wen of Wei sought passage through Zhao to attack Zhongshan. The Marquis of Zhao was about to refuse. Zhao Li said: "That is a mistake! If Wei attacks Zhongshan but cannot obtain it, Wei will withdraw. If they withdraw, Zhao will become more important. But if Wei takes Zhongshan, they will not be able to cross Zhao and keep

^{17.} Chan-Kuo Ts'e, 15.

^{18.} Institutio Oratoria III.8.33-5. All translations in this paper are my own. The original: "Ita non tantum utrum melius sed quid sit optimum quaeritur, itemque contra. Nec umquam incidet in hoc genere materiae dubitatio rei quae undique secundum nos sit; nam ubi contradictioni locus non est, quae potest esse causa dubitandi? Ita fere omnis suasoria nihil est aliud quam comparatio, uidendumque quid consecuturi simus et per quid, ut aestimari possit plus in eo quod petimus sit commodi, an uero in eo per quod petimus sit incommodi."

Zhongshan [i.e. the presence of Zhao between Wei and Zhongshan will prevent the conquerors from effective governance of their new territory]. Thus Wei will use troops while Zhao will gain land. It is better to allow passage with great encouragement. They will then know that your majesty will profit by it; they will have to desist. It would be best for your majesty to grant them passage, as though you had no other choice."

(6.9af.; 18.893f.; 233)

In this, a typical passage in the *Intrigues*, we can discern a technique found in much of the text: presenting an initial proposed course of action and then a detailed argument refuting it. In this item, the "greater advantage," from Quintilian's point of view, lies in Zhao Li's method.

Perhaps the most famous selection of this type is the debate between Sima Cuo and Zhang Yi, to which we have alluded before. Where should Qin attack? The revered minister Zhang Yi advocates attacking Imperial Zhou, seizing the Nine Tripods and claiming the Empire. But then Sima Cuo points out the adverse effects such a brazen step would have on Qin's relations with its neighbors: "Stealing the Son of Heaven—stealing the Son of Heaven is a bad reputation." He argues instead for attacking the rich but under—developed land of Shu, which Qin could take "like jackals and wolves pursuing a flock of sheep." Sima Cuo's plan promises immeasurable wealth and universal respect: "Your profit will exhaust the Western Sea, yet the various lords will not consider you avaricious." The tension created here is heightened by the great disparity in influence of the two parties. Zhang Yi is one of the most respected advisors under Heaven; Sima Cuo is at this stage a relative unknown. But the king chooses Sima Cuo's alternative, which, judging from hindsight, history seems to have favored as well.

What interests us primarily about this passage is its structure. The author, ostensibly sensitive to the same concerns as Quintilian, recognizes that there were various reasonable points of view at the time. After all, if

Qin's object was the Empire, then the most natural way to obtain it would appear to be a direct attack on Zhou. But there would be little point in writing this piece if there were no alternative arguments—Quintilian uses the word "contradictions"—to consider. Thus the author employs the same solution as the writers of Roman suasoriae and presents two different arguments for Sima Cuo to weigh.

Judging from these items, then, it would seem that Crump's theory is suitable in large part. As we have seen, both the suasoriae and the *Intrigues* are examples of the genre of prosopopoeia—the exercise of writing fictitious speeches for historical characters involved in actual, usually well—documented, situations. In addition, the argument—counterargument structure of the suasoria fits many of the pieces in the *Intrigues*. In a suasoria, there must be evidence on both sides, or else there is nothing to discuss. Similarly, many of the persuasions in the *Intrigues* are made effective by the successful refutation of an opposing position. 19

However, the two forms differ considerably in their usage of rhetorical devices. As any student of Latin or Greek may attest, one of the salient features of classical rhetoric is its frequent employment of conventional devices, ranged and named in long lists that can be found in much of the ancient theoretical literature. There we may find, for example, anaphora—the placement of the same word or phrase at the head of consecutive clauses;

^{19.} Another observation of Quintilian's regarding prosopopoeiae in general concerns the inherent difficulty of impersonating different characters. The best writers can employ varying registers of speech according to the rank and temperament of the characters speaking. The *Intrigues* seem to be aware of this problem as well. We may note the majesty and solemnity of the king's speech ("Good, We shall hear [=follow] the Master"), and, in contrast, Sima Cuo's emotional catalogue of relative advantages and disadvantages (e.g. "Stealing the Son of Heaven—stealing the Son of Heaven is a bed reputation").

apostrophe--addressing an absent person; aposiopoesis--leaving the end of a sentence unspoken; asyndeton--coordinated words juxtaposed without conjunctions; litotes--expressing a positive attribute through the negation of its opposite; praeteritio--announcing the intention not to refer to a certain subject and thereby alluding to it obliquely; hendiadys--connecting two nouns, the first acting as an attribute modifying the second; epithet transfer--placing an adjective in grammatical agreement with a noun it is not intended to modify; and the like.

It is not immediately clear whether these devices appear, either in the same or adapted form, in the Chinese rhetoric of the *Intrigues*. This is a legitimate concern. The suasoria is, as we have emphasized, a product of the intricate rhetorical style that engendered it, a kind of apprentice's training in the complicated mode of oratory of the time. Therefore, it should exhibit the frequent, if affected or clumsy, use of these tropes and figures—the tools of the student's future trade. The Roman figures are, as we have mentioned above, devices suited to the persuasion of crowds. Rhetoric for the masses was made a necessity by the circumstances that prevailed in Rome; but rarely, if ever, in the context of the *Intrigues* is an orator required to convince a mass of people of his opinion. Thus one question raised by Crump's proposed analogy is whether the persuasions of the *Intrigues* resort to similar rhetorical devices, and whether they may have devices of their own.

Different languages tend to display markedly different grammatical systems. Some are highly inflected and allow for free word order. In others, the logic of the sentence appears exclusively in the syntax; the different functions of words are indicated by their placement. There is generally less opportunity for variation with word order in languages of this latter type. This distinction is significant: while we may not be surprised to see certain

very general devices—such as isocolon/parallelism, simile, antithesis, assonance, and rhyme—in the literatures of various cultures, devices which rely on liberal word order will tend to appear in the languages of the inflected type—and not in the others. Latin happens to come under the first category, classical Chinese under the second—and for this reason many of the Latin figures typical of inflected languages—such as asyndeton, hendiadys, and epithet transfer—are not likely to appear in Chinese rhetoric.

The suasoriae of Seneca, as we might expect, abound in rhetorical devices. The following (VI.xxvi.24) is a typical example of Latin chiasmus (A-B-B'-A' structure--from the Greek letter chi X): "nostraque cadens ferus Annibal ira." Here, "cadens ferus Annibal" ("wild Hannibal falling") is in the nominative case, and is therefore the subject. "Nostraque ... ira" ("and our anger") is in the ablative case, indicating medium or means. The whole phrase means something like "and wild Hannibal falling by our anger," although the chiasmus is lost in translation precisely because English is a largely uninflected language, and we cannot arrange the words into the proper chiasmic shape. This particular type of chiasmus can be found only in a language like Latin, whose complex nominal and adjectival declensions can accommodate the necessary word order.

It is absent from the *Intrigues*: the logic of the Chinese sentence cannot be wrenched to form a chiasmus. It is similarly inappropriate to speak of asyndeton in Chinese, since words are regularly connected without conjunctions. For example, the "jackals and wolves" which we saw in the debate between Zhang I and Sima Cuo were written simply "jackals wolves." Only in languages like Latin (and English), with their habitual use of conjunctions, can there be any discussion of asyndeton as a device, because only in these languages does it have any unusual effect. When Shakespeare

writes "hang, beg, starve, die in the streets" (Romeo and Juliet, III.v.194), English readers are struck by the stark desolation of the phrase. In classical Chinese, what would seem unusual would be to write a similar series of coordinated words any other way.

Hendiadys, furthermore, is impossible in the language of the *Intrigues*, which makes no rigid separations between parts of speech. Transferred epithets, while readily identifiable when declinable—as in Latin—would be unintelligible in Chinese. And anaphora, with its periphrastic repetitiveness, is out of place in the terse style of the *Intrigues*.

In view of the inapplicability of so many Roman devices to classical Chinese, one impediment towards the acceptance of Crump's proposed suasoriatheory is that it cannot take into account the different rhetorical styles of the two forms, suasoria and ce. This is not a trivial criticism. We have pointed out that the suasoria is a Roman invention that owes its existence to the peculiar requirements of classical oratory. But this premise does not exist in Chinese rhetoric. Crump's theory falls slightly short, since it does not attend to the differences in the devices, the style, and above all the language of the two texts.

For the *Intrigues* have devices of their own. Crump himself writes that its

prose will be found to have very strong rhythm, a penchant for antithesis (or chiasm), parisosis (or symmetry of units), consonance verging on rhyme, and all the other devices peculiar to the orator's self-conscious and somewhat fulsome use of language.²⁰

Perhaps this is so; but if a "penchant" for chiasmus is found, it will not be semantic or syntactic chiasmus (as in the case of the example from Seneca discussed above), since it is impossible in Chinese. There may be

^{20.} *Intrigues*, 100.

thematic chiasmus, where the explication of whole themes or concepts may form a chiasmus (this occurs in the Bible),²¹ but this is only one form. In any case, Crump's use of the words antithesis (A-B) and chiasmus (A-B-B'-A') is vague. Antithesis is simpler, and, understandably, more common. And it should be recognized that parisosis, consonance, and rhyme may appear in the *Intrigues* because they are all devices that fit in an uninflected language like Chinese.

On the other hand, sententiae are more typical of the language of the Intrigues. A sententia is a maxim or aphorism expressed in a dense or terse sentence. Sententiae are frequent in the Intrigues, 22 their inherent power rendered all the more forceful by the laconic rhythm of classical Chinese prose. Litotes (as in the ubiquitous "not a little") and other ornamentations appear as well. The persuasive speeches in the Intrigues do include tropes and figures of their own—those that work in Chinese.

As in Western rhetoric, a large number of the rhetorical devices used in the *Intrigues* do not involve solely the use of language, but particular methods of argumentation and the arrangement of thematic material. With regard to these types of devices too we will find that the *Intrigues* resemble classical rhetoric in some ways, but differ significantly in others.

Ernst Robert Curtius defined "Topoi" as "gedankliche Themen, zu

^{21.} E.g. Genesis 1:9-10: "And God said, 'Let the waters [A] under the heaven be gathered together unto one place, and let dry land [B] appear.' And it was so. And God called the dry land [B'] Earth, and the gathering together of waters [A'] called He seas; and God saw that it was good."

^{22.} E.g. "Do not be alone in knowing [the value of a possession]" (1.4b; 2.87; 4). This may be seen as an early argument from demand theory: a possession is valuable only if others value it too.

beliebiger Entwicklung und Abwandlung geeignet."²³ Here we may use the term to designate arguments and images that can be applied in various situations. They are the most basic tools of orators, which they can use to bolster their positions in different cases. The *Intrigues* use them too, as rhetorical strategies—not unlike, for example, the "affected modesty" topic of the Western rhetoricians. Perhaps the best way to illustrate the diverse possibilities of topics is to list some of those that appear in the *Intrigues*; for there are many, and the persuaders rely on their suasive power at least as much as on linguistic flourishes.

Topics and other Strategies in the Intrigues

- 1. Historical Allusion. The direct reference to a historical incident, citing the circumstances which brought it about as well as the aftermath, serving the twofold function of displaying the erudition of the speaker and providing historical justification for his position. Examples: 1) Su Qin presents a catalogue of opportunistic warriors who took up arms (3.3a; 3.118; 47). 2) Chen Zhen refers to Xiaoji and Zixu, loyal men of old (3.10a; 3.201; 54). 3) Zhang Yi ventures to speak of "matters past" (3.65b; 3.144; 107). This topic is very common.
- 2. Literary Allusion. The reference to a revered work, serving much the same purpose as Historical Allusion. Examples: 1) From the Shijing (Book of Odes) (3.25b; 7.410; 75). 2) From the Shujing (Book of Documents) (3.36a;

^{23.} Europäische Literatur und lateinisches Mittelalter, 3rd edition (Berne and Munich: A. Francke, 1948), 79. Willard Trask (European Literature and the Latin Middle Ages, Bollingen Series 36 [New York, 1953], 79) translates this loosely as: "ideas of the most general sort—such as could be employed in every kind of oratory and writing."

- 5.264; 89). 3) From the Yijing (Book of Changes) (4.13a; 11.608; 130). 4) From the Laozi (4.14a; 11.608; 130).
- 3. Aphorism. Citing a proverb, with the implication that the wisdom of the ancients is on the speaker's side. Examples: 1) "If your feathers are not abundant, you cannot fly high" (3.2b; 3.118; 47). 2) "When the stallion is tired, the nag passes it" (4.44b; 12.636; 158). 3) "Three men make a tiger [if they all claim to see one]" (3.60a; 5.329; 105).
- 4. Induction. Asking questions of one's opponent, to lead him to agree to certain premises, after which one's argument becomes almost irrefutable, since the opposing party has itself proved the fundamental part. Examples: 1) Su Qin leads the King of Qi into attacking Song. The logic here may be forced, since it is difficult to see why attacking Song is particularly profitable; but the format is unmistakable: Su Qin induces the king to say on his own that attacking Song is the best option (4.40b; 11.630; 157). 2) Su Dai convinces the King of Wei to maintain Tian Xu--supposedly a loyal vassal-to watch over two other followers, who, as the king admits himself, are untrustworthy (7.22b; 23.1203; 325).
- 5. Dilemma. a) Reducing the number of possible solutions to two, then refuting one, thereby affirming the other. Examples: 1) The debate between Zhang Yi and Sima Cuo on whether to attack Zhou or Shu (discussed above). 2) Zhang Gai persuades the state of Lu to remain neutral for the time being, since one may attack either now or later, and attacking later is better than attacking now (4.3a; 8.513f.; 117).
 - b) Anti-Dilemma, or Double Persuasion. Showing that an action will have

the same result in all possible series of events. Examples: 1) The widowed Queen Xuan of Qin should not bury her lover Wei Chou with her, as she has planned. If there is no life after death, then what use has she of her paramour? And if there is life after death, then she will be busy enough appeasing her irate husband, and will not have time left over for Wei Chou. The author thus skirts a contentious issue of dogma, arguing that it does not matter, as long as she spares Wei Chou (3.52b; 4.260; 98). 2) Zou Ji can surpass his rival Tian Ji by recommending that the latter engage in battle: for should Tian Ji succeed, the king will reward Zou Ji for his good counsel, and should Tian Ji fail, Zou Ji will be rid of a troublesome competitor (4.3b; 8.497; 118). 3) Zheng Shen, envoy of the King of Chu, takes matters into his own hands by giving away land to the embattled Crown Prince. The envoy has determined, through an intricate series of calculations, that the king will profit regardless of whether his son succeeds or fails (5.27a; 14.735; 207). See also the examples cited by Crump.24

c) Scylla and Charybdis. Finding a clever solution to an infelicitous Anti-Dilemma. This requires finding one's way through a path blocked by two apparently irreconcilable impediments. Examples: 1) Huizi is an enemy of Zhang Yi but a friend of the King of Song—so how should the King of Chu treat him? If he treats him well, Zhang Yi will be offended; if he treats him badly, the King of Song will be offended. The king's advisor Feng He hits upon the solution: support Huizi well and then send him away to the King of Song. This will be please both Zhang Yi and the King of Song (5.23a; 16.806; 198). 2) An adulterous wife plans to poison her husband, but a concubine learns of the plan. How can she avoid betraying either master or mistress?

^{24.} Chan-Kuo Ts'e, 17ff.

She spills poisoned drink intentionally, and is beaten for it, but maintains her honor (9.22bf.; 29.1567; 459). 3) Without a go-between, a girl cannot be married. If her father does not show her to anyone, she will become an old spinster for lack of suitors—but if he does display her, she will be cheapened and remain unbought. The go-between is the only solution (9.23a; 29.1571; 460). 4) The debate analyzed above, over whether or not to grant Wei passage through Zhao, fits into this category as well: it is foolhardy to deny powerful Wei a request, but at the same time dangerous to allow Wei's troops to march through one's territory. Zhao Li navigates the perilous passage. This topic is one of the most prolific; it is a characteristic feature of Chinese literature.²⁵

6. Comparative Syllogism. A type of refutation: citing an instance where a proposition similar to the one being refuted failed, even though the odds of success for the argument in the example were much greater that those in favor of the argument presently being considered. This topic generally takes the form, "if even X, then certainly Y, given that X is less likely to occur than Y." Examples: 1) Even Zeng Shen's mother finally believed slander concerning her own son after hearing it three times. How much more precarious now is Gan Mao's position, given that the king's faith in him is far less than that of Zeng Shen's mother in her son, and that Gan Mao's enemies far more

^{25.} See for example the well-known anecdote at the beginning of the Zuozhuan (James Legge, The Ch'un Ts'eu with the Tso Chuen, vol. 5 of The Chinese Classics [Reprint—Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1970], 2) where a penitent son and his mother are reconciled despite his headstrong vow never to see her again: he visits her after her death in the Yellow Springs. Mencius 4B.24.2 (Legge, II, 329f.) contains another piece with this theme: the archer Yugong Si is sent by his lord to kill Zizhuo Ru. But Yugong Si's teacher happens to be Zizhuo Ru's student. Yugong Si cannot disobey his king, but cannot kill his master's master, either. His solution is to remove the metal tips from his arrows before shooting Zizhuo Ru.

than three (3.22a; 4.230f.; 66). 2) If even Zou Ji is duped by flatterers, the mighty king can expect no less (4.5a; 8.507; 119). 3) If the King of Wei can be moved to believe the preposterous idea that there is a tiger in the market after only three reports to that effect, then he can hardly avoid being swayed by false accusations of Pang Cong, given that the latter's enemies are more than three (7.6b; 23.1232f.; 302).

- 7. The Mask. Showing the root cause of a phenomenon to be a latent force behind the ostensible cause (Removing the Mask), or, vice versa, obscuring the root cause behind the apparent one (Donning the Mask).

 Examples: 1) Zou Ji is praised not because of his beauty, but because of his power (4.5a; 8.507; 119). 2) King Xiang of Qi can take all the credit for Tian Dan's extraordinary acts of charity by ordering grandly that everyone protect the needy. Then everyone will think that Tian Dan is merely carrying out the king's beneficent instructions (4.56af.; 13.680f.; 162). 3) A tiger is about to eat a fox when the latter declares that he is the most powerful beast under heaven, challenging the tiger to follow him around and see for himself. The tiger does so and is convinced when he sees all the animals flee. He does not realize that they are afraid not of the fox, but of the tiger behind him (5.2b; 14.711; 176).
- 8. The Sting. Obtaining from an opponent a valuable concession, often property or land, in exchange for a similar favor to be granted later, but then reneging when circumstances are such that the opponent does not find it expedient to complain or seek redress (the trickster never having had any intention of honoring the agreement in the first place). Examples: 1) Yan Shuai, Zhou's envoy, gains the friendship of Qi by promising to give Qi the

Nine Cauldrons. But Yan Shuai never transports the Cauldrons after all, claiming that there is no safe route from Zhou to Qi--and Qi does not dare have them sent. Thus Zhou gains a valuable ally in Qi while sacrificing nothing (2.1b-3a; 1.6b; 20). 2) Zhang Yi, Qin's envoy, offers the King of Chu 600 square li of land to entice him to break with Qi, his most powerful ally. Although Chen Zhen, the king's minister, is suspicious, the king ignores him. But just as Chen Zhen thought, Zhang Yi later refuses to cede the land when he is sure that Chu has indeed broken with Qi. The King of Chu is incensed, and attacks Qin-again over the protestations of his loyal minister Chen Zhen--and is defeated by the combined might of Qin and Qi, Chu's former ally. Chu is thus stung twice. Chen Zhen's suggestion, which the king does not follow, may fall under the Scylla and Charybdis rubric: he proposes that the King of Chu offer Qin a city in Chu, in order to gain Qin as an ally. With combined forces, Chu and Qin may then attack the isolated Qi, and Chu will obtain in battle a city to match whatever they have given to Qin (3.15a-17a; 4.207-9; 58).

9. Adding Feet to the Snake. Showing that too much of a good thing can ruin everything. Examples: 1) The archer Yang Youji should stop after 100 consecutive bull's-eyes, lest he miss once and erase his streak (1.11a; 2.79; 13). 2) The successful warrior does not risk everything by fighting once too often (3.61a; 19.953; 106). 3) An agreement is made among a group of associates that whoever finishes drawing a snake first can drink a cup of wine. One contestant claims victory, and proudly adds feet to his snake. But before is done, another finishes his own snake, and snatches the cup away: for a snake with feet is no longer a snake at all (4.17b-18a; 9.545; 134).

- 10. Quarreling Tigers. Showing that contending states weaken each other, and that the best policy is therefore to wait and strike when the time is right. Examples: 1) Guan Zhuangzi finds two tigers quarreling over a corpse. He is about to slay them, but Guan Yu convinces him to wait until one is dead and the other wounded. Then he may win fame for killing two tigers while having faced less than one (3.17b; 4.218f.; 59). 2) A mussel has caught a heron by the beak. Neither animal is willing to give way—so they are both caught by a fisherman (9.33a; 30.1631f.; 468).
- 11. Framing. Incriminating a rival, generally by placing him or her in a suspicious situation and convincing a ruler of his or her guilt, often with an "explanatory" letter or speech. Examples: 1) Gan Mao has learned of the king's plan to promote Gongsun Yan to the post of Prime Minister. With great fanfare he compliments the king on his excellent choice, and, when asked, explains falsely that Gongsun Yan himself told him the news. Gongsun Yan is banished (3.24b; 4.251; 73). 2) Naïveté costs a delightful young concubine her nose (5.23b-4a; 17.815f.; 200; this piece will be discussed below).
- 12. Wonder-working. Deceiving the credulous by exploiting their belief in the supernatural, often by bribing diviners to give certain predetermined "fortunes." Examples: 1) The King of Zhao seizes the sacrificial lands of Zhou, but is induced to return them when he falls ill and is told by a false diviner that the sacrificial lands are the cause (2.8a; 1.49; 32). 2) Tian Ji, scheming to usurp the throne, sends a vassal to a diviner for omens. But the diviner reveals everything to the king, his loyalty having been bought beforehand by Tian Ji's enemy. Tian Ji is forced to flee (4.3b-4a; 8.497f.; 118).

These examples are by no means exhaustive; they are merely some of the most illustrative specimens. Identifying these topics makes it easier to understand just what it is about the *Intrigues* that gives them their distinctive flavor: so many of the anecdotes are patterned after these general models. This certainly does not mean that the pieces begin to sound hackneyed; rather, the reader enjoys each with the same eager sense of expectancy, anxious to discover how many ways a versatile image or form of argument will be modified and molded anew.

Other topics include executing disloyal henchmen, warning the king of slander, and more methods of dealing with underhandedness. We can see in the Intrigues the concern that names fit reality, the same theme that occupies so much of Warring States philosophy. Objects are continuously labelled explicitly as what they are, to distinguish them from their misleading appearance. Kings are asked to give their favorite wives a pair of earrings as a gift, or to grant a particularly faithful advisor a large fief or lofty title, so that all know who is in favor—and, consequently, who is not. These tropes are not included in the list above because they are essentially subtopics of Removing the Mask, perhaps the most elegant form of differentiating reality from illusion, the awesome power of the tiger from the wily ways of the fox.

The topics may interest the student of the *Intrigues*, and there is probably more to be said about each. But our main interest here is their relevance to our comparison of the *Intrigues* with the suasoriae of ancient Rome. For such topics appear in classical rhetoric as well. Cicero, in his *De inventione*, lists several different *loci communes*, or commonplaces, that a speaker might use in an oration. Though this youthful work was later repudiated by the author in his more mature *De oratore*, we may still look upon

it as a historical document, a reliable source for learning about fashionable rhetorical techniques of the day. One of the most useful, he writes (I.45), is Induction, exactly the same strategy in which the persuaders of the *Intrigues* specialize. Moreover, he includes a discussion of the merits of Dilemma (I.51ff.), though the term is used somewhat differently from they way we have treated it here. To Cicero, a Dilemma is a question framed in such a manner that no matter how one answers one is doomed (e.g. "Are you still beating your wife?") In any case, the same general idea of being lost—or saved—in all possible cases is present in both the Roman and Chinese versions of Dilemma.

Thus in one important respect, the suasoria-theory would appear to explain the *Intrigues* well: although the figures of speech used in the *Intrigues* differ from those of classical rhetoric as Chinese differs from Latin, some of the strategies that form the skeletons of arguments in the *Intrigues* can be found in Roman rhetoric as well. But, as before, if the suasoria-theory is suitable from one point of view, it does not tell the whole story.

What do the strategies accomplish? Historical Allusion, Literary
Allusion, and Aphorism (nos. 1, 2, and 3 in the list above) may be called
allusive or platitudinous topics. In these, the speaker finds the proper
quotation from a revered source. These topics demand creativity. Of
themselves, they are impotent, since the audience has certainly heard them all
before. The persuader's challenge is to fit them into his argument with
originality and flair.

Induction, Dilemma, and Comparative Syllogism (nos. 4 through 6) are entirely different. We may think of these as formulaic or inventive strategies of argumentation with a broad, if not infinite, range of possible

applications. These topics, unlike the first three, can be shaped to fit almost any situation. They are inexhaustible; they can be used repeatedly with undiminished effect, because they may appear in different contexts each time. They are the orator's guides, the blueprints of his thought, laying out for him the grand structure of his speech.

Adding Feet to the Snake and Quarrelling Tigers (nos. 9 and 10) lie somewhere in between. They are not simply recitations of proverbs, but they are not universally applicable, either. They are, rather, illustrative clichés: on the one hand, they can be used only for certain specific arguments—such as counseling a king to retreat and consolidate his gains; on the other hand, they can be varied with different parables and examples, just like the inventive strategies.

But what do we do with Framing and Wonder-working (nos. 11 and 12)? They are not rhetorical topics at all, because they do not use words as their only or even primary tool. Something like Wonder-working cannot be found anywhere in the suasoriae or classical oratorical repertory because it requires an instrument other than speech. For the same reason, it does not suffice to classify the *Intrigues* as rhetoric when so many of the anecdotes do not consist exclusively of verbal persuasion. Indeed, such an interpretation only diminishes the book's value, turning a blind eye to the charm and appeal of the non-rhetorical pieces that make up so much of the *Intrigues*.

Let us consider, for example, the following anecdote:

The King of Wei sent a beautiful woman to the King of Chu. The King of Chu enjoyed her. Queen Zheng Xiu knew that the king enjoyed the new woman, and she favored the new woman deeply. Be it clothes or trinkets—she picked out whatever she liked and made it hers [i.e. the concubine's]. Be it chambers or furniture—she picked out whatever she thought good and made it hers. She favored her more deeply than the king. The king said, "A woman serves her husband with sensual gratification; but jealousy is her emotion. Now Zheng Xiu knows that We enjoy the new woman; she favors her more deeply that We do. This is the

way a filial son serves his parent, the way a loyal vassal serves his lord."

Zheng Xiu knew that the king did not think her jealous, so she said to the new woman, "The king favors Your beauty! Still, he hates Your nose. When You go to see the king, [You] must cover Your nose."

The new woman saw the king, and covered her nose. The king said to Zheng Xiu, "Why did that new woman cover her nose when she saw Us?" Zheng Xiu said, "I know."
The king said, "Though it be bad, you must say it."

Zheng Xiu said, "Oh! It seems she hates to smell the king's stench!"

The king said, "Shrew!" He ordered, "Cut off her nose. Let there be no opposition to this command."

(5.23bf.; 17.815f.; 200)²⁸

This trick is unforgettable, but it is not rhetoric. Yet no one would argue that it is out of place in the Intrigues. What then are these ce-since they are clearly more than just rhetoric?

The Intrigues are a collection of anecdotes about people from the Warring States period and how they acquire the things they want: position, fame, revenge, glory for the state, and so on. Naturally, since advisors often find the best resource to be the king, they focus their attention to persuade the king to action--action sometimes beneficial to the king and his state, but often advantageous to the counselors themselves and their favorites. These are the rhetorical pieces. But in many of the stories, the characters use very different methods, such as conspiracy, espionage, and framing, to achieve their goals. These anecdotes always involve some sort of scheme or machination to bring about a desired end.

The Intrigues, then, are primarily about intrigue. The lively, disjointed pieces fuse together to paint an irreverent picture of Warring States politics. The entire book seems to be a glorification of mendacity and trickery. The cunning advisors live by their wits, rising and falling by

^{26.} Honorific pronouns are capitalized: thus zi is rendered as "You," guaren as "We."

their own ingenuity and that of their rivals. By contrast, the kings are continuously hoodwinked by the unscrupulous sophistry of their own ministers. Some, like Lord Mengchang (e.g. 4.35b-36b; 10.579f.; 153) accept the duplicity of their retainers and even encourage it, on a manageable scale, rather than oppose it fruitlessly. But most do not, and are deceived throughout.

The Intrigues form a document from turbulent times, and the jungle law they advocate reflects the circumstances in which they originated. Scholars have been reluctant to concede this point because of the clear anti-Confucian message it entails.²⁷ But the position of the Intrigues is unmistakable: all is due to him who attains it; the more devious the plot, the more entertaining; virtue and loyalty are eminently unprofitable. They are a paean to miching mallecho.

If we must find a Western analogy for the *Intrigues*, let us look to the *Arabian Nights* and the medieval European fabliaux. All three raise trickery to an art form with pure delight. Differences in culture can explain differences in what the schemers scheme for. Su Qin's greatest honor is the respect he commands from his family (3.6a; 3.120; 47), while "hende Nicholas" of the Miller's Tale--though he later pays for his exploit--can claim a night with his beloved Alisoun, and the Lady with the Five Suitors (Nights 593-6) frees her lover and brings shame upon the five lechers who would have taken advantage of her helplessness. Yet the spirit is the same in all three instances: a clever stratagem succeeds. The suasoriae may be similar to the *Intrigues* in some respects, but the bawdy fabliaux may offer other enticing possibilities.

^{27.} Liu Xiang, in his own preface to the work (given in Zhu Zugeng, III, 1795f.), acknowledges that he was hesitant to publish the text, but accepts the *Intrigues* as a text of its own chaotic time.

Still, Crump's theory is helpful because it is so daring. It does not explain the differences between Latin and Chinese, and the rhetorical devices used in each language; or the differences between topics in the suasoriae and in the Intrigues; or the differences in the basic purposes behind the two forms, the former a school exercise intended to train young men in the arts of oratory, the latter an amusing collection of devious plots and a reconsideration of traditional virtues. Yet the arresting originality of Crump's theory will bring the Intrigues to the attention of scholars in a different light. Some will challenge his theory, but others will defend it; all of this disputation can only deepen our understanding of the text and stimulate us to probe further into the context in which it was created. Crump has shown us a new way of looking at a very old text, and he may rightly take his place beside Zhang Yi and Su Qin as one of the most accomplished rhetoricians of the Zhanguace.

ce	Glossary of (Tian Xu	田需
Chen Zhen	陳軫	Wei	独
Chu	楚	Wei Chou	魏醜
Feng He	馮郝	Wen	艾
Gan Mao	甘茂	Xiang	表 ・ ・ ・ ・ ・ ・
Gongsun Yan	公孫衍	Xiaoji	文襄君宣
guaren	寿人 然の	Xuan	直 被动
Guan Yu	管與	Yan Shuai	顏率 美山甘
Guan Zhuangzi	管莊子	Yang Youji	養由基
<i>Guoce kanyan</i> Han	國策勘研 漢	<i>Yijing</i> Yugong Si	易經 庾公斯
Huizi	惠子	Yugong Si Zeng Shen	アム別 曾参
Laozí	芯↓ 李子	Zhanquoce	日夕 戦國策
li	老子	Zhanguoce Zhanguoce jizhu	報國策集注
Liu Xiang	劉向	huikao	東西東京
Lu	魯	Zhanquoce yanjiu	戦國策研究
Mengchang	孟嘗	Zhang Gai	張丐
Pang Cong	龐葱	Zhang Yi	張儀
Qi	齊	Zhao	趙
Qin	<i>万</i> 秦	Zhao Li	趙利
~ Shiji	秦 史記	Zheng Liangshu	鄭良樹
Shijing	詩經	Zheng Shen	鄭申
Shu	蜀	Zheng Xiu	鄭袖
Shujing	書經	Zhong Fengnian	鐘鳳年
Sibu congkan	四部叢刊	Zhongshan	中山
Sima Cuo	司馬錯	Zhou	周
Sima Qian	司馬遷	Zhu Zugeng	諸祖耿
Song	宋	zi	子子
Su Dai	蘇代	Zixu	子胥
Su Qin	蘇秦	Zizhuo Ru	十 徭播
Tian Dan	田單	Zou Ji	都忌
Tian Ji	思忌	Zuozhuan	左傳

Previous Issues

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
1	Nov. 1986	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	The Need for an Alphabetically Arranged General Usage Dictionary of Mandarin Chinese: A Review Article of Some Recent Dictionaries and Current Lexicographical Projects	31
2	Dec. 1986	Andrew Jones Hiroshima	The Poetics of Uncertainty in Early Chinese Literature	45
3	March 1987	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	A Partial Bibliography for the Study of Indian Influence on Chinese Popular Literature	iv, 214
4	Nov. 1987	Robert M. Sanders University of Hawaii	The Four Languages of "Mandarin"	14
5	Dec. 1987	Eric A. Havelock Vassar College	Chinese Characters and the Greek Alphabet	4
6	Jan. 1988	J. Marshall Unger University of Hawaii	Computers and Japanese Literacy: Nihonzin no Yomikaki Nôryoku to Konpyuta	13
7	Jan. 1988	Chang Tsung-tung Goethe-Universität	Indo-European Vocabulary in Old Chinese	i, 56
8	Feb. 1988	various	Reviews (I)	ii, 39
9	Dec. 1988	Soho Machida Daitoku-ji, Kyoto	Life and Light, the Infinite: A Historical and Philological Analysis of the Amida Cult	46
10	June 1989	Pratoom Angurarohita Chulalongkorn University Bangkok	Buddhist Influence on the Neo- Confucian Concept of the Sage	31
11	July 1989	Edward Shaughnessy University of Chicago	Western Cultural Innovations in China, 1200 BC	8

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
12	Aug. 1989	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	The Contributions of T'ang and Five Dynasties Transformation Texts (<i>pien-wen</i>) to Later Chinese Popular Literature	71
13	Oct. 1989	Jiaosheng Wang Shanghai	The Complete Ci-Poems of Li Qingzhao: A New English Translation	xii, 122
14	Dec. 1989	various	Reviews (II)	69
15	Jan. 1990	George Cardona University of Pennsylvania	On Attitudes Toward Language in Ancient India	19
16	March 1990	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	Three Brief Essays Concerning Chinese Tocharistan	16
17	April 1990	Heather Peters University Museum of Philadelphia	Tattooed Faces and Stilt Houses: Who Were the Ancient Yue?	28
18	May 1990	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	 a. Two Non-Tetragraphic Northern Sinitic Languages b. Implications of the Soviet Dungan Script for Chinese Language Reform c. Who Were the Gyámi? 	28
19	June 1990	Bosat Man Nalanda	Backhill/Peking/Beijing	6
20	Oct. 1990	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	Introduction and Notes for a Translation of the Ma-wang-tui MSS of the <i>Lao Tzu</i>	68

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
21	Dec. 1990	Philippa Jane Benson Carnegie Mellon University	Two Cross-Cultural Studies on Reading Theory	9, 13
22	March 1991	David Moser University of Michigan	Slips of the Tongue and Pen in Chinese	45
23	April 1991	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	Tracks of the Tao, Semantics of Zen	10
24	Aug. 1991	David A. Utz University of Pennsylvania	Language, Writing, and Tradition in Iran	24
25	Aug. 1991	Jean DeBernardi University of Alberta	Linguistic Nationalism: The Case of Southern Min	22 + 3 figs.
26	Sept. 1991	JAO Tsung-i Chinese University of Hong Kong	Questions on the Origins of Writing Raised by the Silk Road	10
27	Aug. 1991	Victor H. Mair, ed. University of Pennsylvania	Schriftfestschrift: Essays in Honor of John DeFrancis on His Eightieth Birthday	ix, 245
28	Sept. 1991	ZHOU Youguang State Language Commission, Peking	The Family of Chinese Character- Type Scripts (Twenty Members and Four Stages of Development)	11
29	Sept. 1991	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	What Is a Chinese "Dialect/Topolect"? Reflections on Some Key Sino-English Linguistic Terms	31
30	Oct. 1991	M. V. Sofronov Institute of Far Eastern Studies, Academy of Sciences, Moscow	Chinese Philology and the Scripts of Central Asia	10
31	Oct. 1991	various	Reviews (III)	68

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
32	Aug. 1992	David McCraw University of Hawaii	How the Chinawoman Lost Her Voice	27
33	Sept. 1992	FENG Lide and Kevin Stuart Chuankou No. 1 Middle School and Qinghai Education College	Interethnic Contact on the Inner Asian Frontier: The Gangou People of Minhe County, Qinghai	34
34	Oct. 1992	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	 Two Papers on Sinolinguistics A Hypothesis Concerning the Origin of the Term <i>fanqie</i> ("Countertomy") East Asian Round-Trip Words 	13
35	Nov. 1992	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania with an added note by Edwin G. Pulleyblank	Reviews (IV)	37
36	Feb. 1993	XU Wenkan Hanyu Da Cidian editorial offices, Shanghai	Hanyu Wailaici de Yuyuan Kaozheng he Cidian Bianzuan (Philological Research on the Etymology of Loanwords in Sinitic and Dictionary Compilation)	13
37	March 1993	Tanya Storch University of New Mexico	Chinese Buddhist Historiography and Orality	16
38	April 1993	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	The Linguistic and Textual Antecedents of <i>The Sutra of the</i> Wise and the Foolish	95
39	Aug. 1993	Jordan Paper York University	A Material Case for a Late Bering Strait Crossing Coincident with Pre-Columbian Trans-Pacific Crossings	17

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
40	Sept. 1993	Michael Carr Center for Language Studies, Otaru University of Commerce	Tiao-Fish through Chinese Dictionaries	68
41	Oct. 1993	Paul Goldin Harvard University	Miching Mallecho: The <i>Zhanguo ce</i> and Classical Rhetoric	27
42	Nov. 1993	Renchin-Jashe Yulshul Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture, Kokonor (Qinghai) and Kevin Stuart Institute of Foreign Languages, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia	Kham Tibetan Language Materials	39
43	Dec. 1993	MA Quanlin, MA Wanxiang, and MA Zhicheng Xining Edited by Kevin Stuart Kokonor	Salar Language Materials	72
44	Jan. 1994	Dolkun Kamberi Columbia University	The Three Thousand Year Old Charchan Man Preserved at Zaghunluq	15
45	May 1994	Mark Hansell Carleton College	The Sino-Alphabet: The Assimilation of Roman Letters into the Chinese Writing System	28
46	July 1994	various	Reviews (V)	2, 155
47	Aug. 1994	Robert S. Bauer Mahidol University Salaya Nakornpathom, Thailand	Sino-Tibetan *kolo "Wheel"	11
48	Sept. 1994	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	Introduction and Notes for a Complete Translation of the <i>Chuang Tzu</i>	xxxiv, 110

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
49	Oct. 1994	Ludo Rocher University of Pennsylvania	Orality and Textuality in the Indian Context	28
50	Nov. 1994	YIN Binyong State Language Commission and Institute for Applied Linguistics (Chinese Academy of Social Sciences)	Diyi ge Lading Zimu de Hanyu Pinyin Fang'an Shi Zenyang Chansheng de? [How Was the First Romanized Spelling System for Sinitic Produced?]	7
51	Nov. 1994	HAN Kangxin Institute of Archeology Chinese Academy of Social Sciences	The Study of Ancient Human Skeletons from Xinjiang, China	9 + 4 figs.
52	Nov. 1994	Warren A. Shibles University of Wisconsin Whitewater	Chinese Romanization Systems: IPA Transliteration	20
53	Nov. 1994	XU Wenkan Editorial Offices of the Hanyu Da Cidian Shanghai	Guanyu Tuhuoluoren de Qiyuan he Qianxi Wenti [On the Problem of the Origins and Migrations of the Tocharians]	11
54	Nov. 1994	Üjiyediin Chuluu (Chaolu Wu) University of Toronto	Introduction, Grammar, and Sample Sentences for Jegün Yogur	34
55	Nov. 1994	Üjiyediin Chuluu (Chaolu Wu) University of Toronto	Introduction, Grammar, and Sample Sentences for Dongxiang	34
56	Nov. 1994	Üjiyediin Chuluu (Chaolu Wu) University of Toronto	Introduction, Grammar, and Sample Sentences for Dagur	36
57	Nov. 1994	Üjiyediin Chuluu (Chaolu Wu) University of Toronto	Introduction, Grammar, and Sample Sentences for Monguor	31

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
58	Nov. 1994	Üjiyediin Chuluu (Chaolu Wu) University of Toronto	Introduction, Grammar, and Sample Sentences for Baoan	28
59	Dec. 1994	Kevin Stuart Qinghai Junior Teachers College; Limusishiden Qinghai Medical College Attached Hospital, Xining, Kokonor (Qinghai)	China's Monguor Minority: Ethnography and Folktales	i, I, 193
60	Dec. 1994	Kevin Stuart, Li Xuewei, and Shelear Qinghai Junior Teachers College, Xining, Kokonor (Qinghai)	China's Dagur Minority: Society, Shamanism, and Folklore	vii, 167
61	Dec. 1994	Kevin Stuart and Li Xuewei Qinghai Junior Teachers College, Xining, Kokonor (Qinghai)	Tales from China's Forest Hunters: Oroqen Folktales	iv, 59
62	Dec. 1994	William C. Hannas Georgetown University	Reflections on the "Unity" of Spoken and Written Chinese and Academic Learning in China	5
63	Dec. 1994	Sarah M. Nelson University of Denver	The Development of Complexity in Prehistoric North China	17
64	Jan. 1995	Arne Østmoe Bangkok, Thailand, and Drøbak, Norway	A Germanic-Tai Linguistic Puzzle	81, 6
65	Feb. 1995	Penglin Wang Chinese University of Hong Kong	Indo-European Loanwords in Altaic	28
66	March 1995	ZHU Qingzhi Sichuan University and Peking University	Some Linguistic Evidence for Early Cultural Exchange Between China and India	7

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
67	April 1995	David McCraw University of Hawaii	Pursuing Zhuangzi as a Rhymemaster: A Snark-Hunt in Eight Fits	38
68	May 1995	Ke Peng, Yanshi Zhu University of Chicago and Tokyo, Japan	New Research on the Origin of Cowries Used in Ancient China	i, 26
69	Jan. 1996	Dpal-ldan-bkra-shis, Keith Slater, et al. Qinghai, Santa Barbara, etc.	Language Materials of China's Monguor Minority: Huzhu Mongghul and Minhe Mangghuer	xi, 266
70	Feb. 1996	David Utz, Xinru Liu, Taylor Carman, Bryan Van Norden, and the Editor Philadelphia, Vassar, etc.	Reviews VI	93
71	March 1996	Erik Zürcher Leiden University Seishi Karashima Soka University Huanming Qin Tang Studies Hotline	Vernacularisms in Medieval Chinese Texts	31 + 11 + 8
72	May 1996	E. Bruce Brooks University of Massachusetts	The Life and Mentorship of Confucius	44
73	June 1996	ZHANG Juan, et al., and Kevin Stuart Qinghai, Inner Mongolia, Shanxi, Henan, Liaoning	Blue Cloth and Pearl Deer; Yogur Folklore	iii, 76
74	Jan. 1997	David Moser University of Michigan & Beijing Foreign Studies University	Covert Sexism in Mandarin Chinese	23
75	Feb. 1997	Haun Saussy Stanford University	The Prestige of Writing: Wen ² , Letter, Picture, Image, Ideography	40

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
76	Feb. 1997	Patricia Eichenbaum Karetzky Bard College	The Evolution of the Symbolism of the Paradise of the Buddha of Infinite Life and Its Western Origins	28
77	Jan. 1998	Daniel Hsieh Purdue University	The Origin and Nature of the "Nineteen Old Poems"	49
78	Feb. 1998	Narsu Inner Mongolia College of Agriculture & Animal Husbandry Kevin Stuart Qinghai Junior Teachers' College	Practical Mongolian Sentences (With English Translation)	iii + 49 + ii + 66
79	March 1998	Dennis Grafflin Bates College	A Southeast Asian Voice in the Daodejing?	8
80	July 1998	Taishan Yu Chinese Academy of Social Sciences	A Study of Saka History	ii + 225
81	Sept. 1998	Hera S. Walker Ursinus College (Philadelphia)	Indigenous or Foreign?: A Look at the Origins of the Monkey Hero Sun Wukong	iv + 110
82	Sept. 1998	I. S. Gurevich Russian Academy of Sciences	A Fragment of a pien-wen(?) Related to the Cycle "On Buddha's Life"	15
83	Oct. 1998	Minglang Zhou University of Colorado at Boulder	Tense/Aspect markers in Mandarin and Xiang dialects, and their contact	20
84	Oct. 1998	Ulf Jäger Gronau/Westfalen, Germany	The New Old Mummies from Eastern Central Asia: Ancestors of the Tocharian Knights Depicted on the Buddhist Wallpaintings of Kucha and Turfan? Some Circumstantial Evidence	9

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
85	Oct. 1998	Mariko Namba Walter University of New England	Tokharian Buddhism in Kucha: Buddhism of Indo-European Centum Speakers in Chinese Turkestan before the 10th Century C.E.	30
86	Oct. 1998	Jidong Yang University of Pennsylvania	Siba: Bronze Age Culture of the Gansu Corridor	18
87	Nov. 1998	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	Canine Conundrums: Eurasian Dog Ancestor Myths in Historical and Ethnic Perspective	74
88	Dec. 1998	Saroj Kumar Chaudhuri Aichi Gakusen University	Siddham in China and Japan	9, 124
89	Jan. 1999	Alvin Lin Yale University	Writing Taiwanese: The Development of Modern Written Taiwanese	4+41+4
90	Jan. 1999	Victor H. Mair et al	Reviews VII [including review of The Original Analects]	2, 38
91	Jan. 1999	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	Phonosymbolism or Etymology: The Case of the Verb "Cop"	28
92	Jan. 1999	Christine Louise Lin Dartmouth College	The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan and the Advocacy of Local Autonomy	xiii + 136
93	Jan. 1999	David S. Nivison Stanford University	The Key to the Chronology of the Three Dynasties: The "Modern Text" Bamboo Annals	iv + 68
94	March 1999	Julie Lee Wei Hoover Institute	Correspondence Between the Chinese Calendar Signs and the Phoenician Alphabet	65 + 6

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
95	May 1999	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	A Medieval, Central Asian Buddhist Theme in a Late Ming Taoist Tale by Feng Meng-lung	27
96	June 1999	E. Bruce Brooks University of Massachusetts	Alexandrian Motifs in Chinese Texts	14
97	Dec. 1999	LI Shuicheng Peking University	Sino-Western Contact in the Second Millennium BC	iv, 29
98	Jan. 2000	Peter Daniels, Daniel Boucher, and other authors	Reviews VIII	108
99	Feb. 2000	Anthony Barbieri-Low Princeton University	Wheeled Vehicles in the Chinese Bronze Age (c. 2000-741 BC)	v, 98 + 5 color plates
100	Feb. 2000	Wayne Alt Community College of Baltimore County (Essex)	Zhuangzi, Mysticism, and the Rejection of Distinctions	29
101	March 2000	C. Michele Thompson South Connecticut State University	The Viêt Peoples and the Origins of Nom	71, 1
102	March 2000	Theresa Jen Bryn Mawr College Ping Xu Baruch College	Penless Chinese Character Reproduction	15
103	June 2000	Carrie E. Reid Middlebury College	Early Chinese Tattoo	52
104	July 2000	David W. Pankenier Lehigh University	Popular Astrology and Border Affairs in Early China	19 + 1 color plate
105	Aug. 2000	Anne Birrell Cambridge University	Postmodernist Theory in Recent Studies of Chinese Literature	31

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
106	Sept. 2000	Yu Taishan Chinese Academy of Social Sciences	A Hypothesis about the Sources of the Sai Tribes	i, 3, 200
107	Sept. 2000	Jacques deLisle, Adelheid E. Krohne, and the editor	Reviews IX	148 + map
108	Sept. 2000	Ruth H. Chang University of Pennsylvania	Understanding <i>Di</i> and <i>Tian</i> : Deity and Heaven From Shang to Tang	vii, 54
109	Oct. 2000	Conán Dean Carey Stanford University	In Hell the One without Sin is Lord	ii, 60
110	Oct. 2000	Toh Hoong Teik Harvard University	Shaykh 'Alam: The Emperor of Early Sixteenth-Century China	20
111	Nov. 2000	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	The Need for a New Era	10
112	July 2001	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	Notes on the Anau Inscription	xi, 93
113	Aug. 2001	Ray Collins Chepachet, RI David Kerr Melbourne, FL	Etymology of the Word "Macrobiotic:s" and Its Use in Modern Chinese Scholarship	18
114	March 2002	Ramnath Subbaraman University of Chicago	Beyond the Question of the Monkey Imposter: Indian Influence on the Chinese Novel, <i>The Journey</i> to the West	35
115	April 2002	ZHOU Jixu Sichuan Normal University	Correspondences of Basic Words Between Old Chinese and Proto- Indo-European	8

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
116	May 2002	LIU Yongquan Institute of Linguistics, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences	On the Problem of Chinese Lettered Words	13
117	May 2002	SHANG Wei Columbia University	Baihua, Guanhua, Fangyan and the May Fourth Reading of Rulin Waishi	10
118	June 2002	Justine T. Snow Port Townsend, WA	Evidence for the Indo-European Origin of Two Ancient Chinese Deities	ii, 75, 1 color, 1 b-w print
119	July 2002	WU Zhen Xinjiang Museum, Ürümchi	"Hu" Non-Chinese as They Appear in the Materials from the Astana Graveyard at Turfan	21, 5 figs.
120	July 2002	Anne Birrell University of Cambridge, Clare Hall	Female-Gendered Myth in the Classic of Mountains and Seas	47
121	July 2002	Mark Edward Lewis Stanford University	Dicing and Divination in Early China	22, 7 figs.
122	July 2002	Julie Wilensky Yale Univesity	The Magical <i>Kunlun</i> and "Devil Slaves": Chinese Perceptions of Dark-skinned People and Africa before 1500	51, 3 figs.
123	Aug. 2002	Paul R. Goldin and the editor	Reviews X	30
124	August 2002	Fredrik T. Hiebert University of Pennsylvania John Colarusso McMaster University	The Context of the Anau Seal Remarks on the Anau and Niyä Seals	1-34 35-47

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
125	July 2003	ZHOU Jixu Sichuan Normal University Shanghai Normal University	Correspondences of Cultural Words between Old Chinese and Proto- Indo-European	19
126	Aug. 2003	Tim Miller University of Washington	A Southern Min Word in the <i>Tsu-t'ang chi</i>	14
127	Oct. 2003	Sundeep S. Jhutti Petaluma, California	The Getes	125, 8 color plates
128	Nov. 2003	Yinpo Tschang New York City	On Proto-Shang	18
129	Dec. 2003	Michael Witzel Harvard University	Linguistic Evidence for Cultural Exchange in Prehistoric Western Central Asia	70
130	Feb. 2004	Bede Fahey Fort St. John, British Columbia	Mayan: A Sino-Tibetan Language? A Comparative Study	61
131	March 2004	Taishan Yu Chinese Academy of Social Sciences	A History of the Relationship between the Western and Eastern Han, Wei, Jin, Northern and Southern Dynasties and the Western Regions	1, 3, 352
132	April 2004	Kim Hayes Sydney	On the Presence of Non-Chinese at Anyang	11
133	April 2004	John L. Sorenson Brigham Young University Carl L. Johannessen University of Oregon	Scientific Evidence for Pre- Columbian Transoceanic Voyages CD-ROM	48, 166, 19, 15 plates
134	May 2004	Xieyan Hincha Neumädewitz, Germany	Two Steps Toward Digraphia in China	i, 22

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
135	May 2004	John J. Emerson Portland, Oregon	The Secret History of the Mongols and Western Literature	21
136	May 2004	Serge Papillon Mouvaux, France and Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia	Influences tokhariennes sur la mythologie chinoise	47
137	June 2004	Hoong Teik Toh Harvard University	Some Classical Malay Materials for the Study of the Chinese Novel <i>Journey to the West</i>	64
138	June 2004	Julie Lee Wei San Jose and London	Dogs and Cats: Lessons from Learning Chinese	17
139	June 2004	Taishan Yu Chinese Academy of Social Sciences	A Hypothesis on the Origin of the Yu State	20
140	June 2004	Yinpo Tschang New York City	Shih and Zong: Social Organization in Bronze Age China	28
141	July 2004	Yinpo Tschang New York City	Chaos in Heaven: On the Calendars of Preclassical China	30
142	July 2004	Katheryn Linduff, ed. <i>University of Pittsburgh</i>	Silk Road Exchange in China	64
143	July 2004	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	Sleep in <i>Dream</i> : Soporific Responses to Depression in <i>Story</i> of the Stone	99
144	July 2004	RONG Xinjiang Peking University	Land Route or Sea Route? Commentary on the Study of the Paths of Transmission and Areas in which Buddhism Was Disseminated during the Han Period	32
145	Aug. 2004	the editor	Reviews XI	2, 41

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
146	Feb. 2005	Hoong Teik Toh Academia Sinica	The <i>-yu</i> Ending in Xiongnu, Xianbei, and Gaoju Onomastica	24
147	March 2005	Hoong Teik Toh Academia Sinica	Ch. <i>Qiong</i> ~ Tib. Khyung; Taoism ~ Bonpo Some Questions Related to Early Ethno-Religious History in Sichuan	18
148	April 2005	Lucas Christopoulos Beijing Sports University	Le gréco-bouddhisme et l'art du poing en Chine	52
149	May 2005	Kimberly S. Te Winkle University College, London	A Sacred Trinity: God, Mountain, and Bird: Cultic Practices of the Bronze Age Chengdu Plain	ii, 103 (41 in color)
150	May 2005	Dolkun Kamberi Washington, DC	Uyghurs and Uyghur Identity	44
151	June 2005	Jane Jia SI University of Pennsylvania	The Genealogy of Dictionaries: Producers, Literary Audience, and the Circulation of English Texts in the Treaty Port of Shanghai	44, 4 tables
152	June 2005	Denis Mair Seattle	The Dance of Qian and Kun in the <i>Zhouyi</i>	13, 2 figs.
153	July 2005	Alan Piper London (UK)	The Mysterious Origins of the Word "Marihuana"	17
154	July 2005	Serge Papillon Belfort, France	Mythologie sino-européenne	174, 1 plate
155	July 2005	Denis Mair Seattle	Janus-Like Concepts in the <i>Li</i> and <i>Kun</i> Trigrams	8
156	July 2005	Abolqasem Esmailpour Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran	Manichean Gnosis and Creation	157
157	Aug. 2005	Ralph D. Sawyer Independent Scholar	Paradoxical Coexistence of Prognostication and Warfare	13

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
158	Aug. 2005	Mark Edward Lewis Stanford University	Writings on Warfare Found in Ancient Chinese Tombs	15
159	Aug. 2005	Jens Østergaard Petersen University of Copenhagen	The Zuozhuan Account of the Death of King Zhao of Chu and Its Sources	47
160	Sept. 2005	Matteo Compareti Venice	Literary Evidence for the Identification of Some Common Scenes in Han Funerary Art	14
161	Sept. 2005	Julie Lee Wei London	The Names of the <i>Yi Jing</i> Trigrams: An Inquiry into Their Linguistic Origins	18
162	Sept. 2005	Julie Lee Wei London	Counting and Knotting: Correspondences between Old Chinese and Indo-European	71, map
163	Oct. 2005	Julie Lee Wei London	Huangdi and Huntun (the Yellow Emperor and Wonton): A New Hypothesis on Some Figures in Chinese Mythology	44
164	Oct. 2005	Julie Lee Wei London	Shang and Zhou: An Inquiry into the Linguistic Origins of Two Dynastic Names	62
165	Oct. 2005	Julie Lee Wei London	DAO and DE: An Inquiry into the Linguistic Origins of Some Terms in Chinese Philosophy and Morality	51
166	Nov. 2005	Julie Lee Wei London Hodong Kim Seoul National University and David Selvia and the Editor both of the University of Pennsylvania	Reviews XII	i, 63

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
167	Dec. 2005	ZHOU Jixu Sichuan Normal University	Old Chinese '帝*tees' and Proto- Indo-European "*deus": Similarity in Religious Ideas and a Common Source in Linguistics	17
168	Dec. 2005	Judith A. Lerner New York City	Aspects of Assimilation: the Funerary Practices and Furnishings of Central Asians in China	51, v, 9 plates
169	Jan. 2006	Victor H. Mair University of Pennsylvania	Conversion Tables for the Three- Volume Edition of the <i>Hanyu Da</i> <i>Cidian</i>	i, 284
170	Feb. 2006	Amber R. Woodward University of Pennsylvania	Learning English, Losing Face, and Taking Over: The Method (or Madness) of Li Yang and His Crazy English	18

Beginning with issue no. 171, *Sino-Platonic Papers* will be published electronically on the Web. Issues from no. 1 to no. 170, however, will continue to be sold as paper copies until our stock runs out, after which they too will be made available on the Web. For prices of paper copies, see the catalog at www.sino-platonic.org

171	June 2006	John DeFrancis University of Hawaii	The Prospects for Chinese Writing Reform	26, 3 figs.
172	Aug. 2006	Deborah Beaser	The Outlook for Taiwanese Language Preservation	18
173	Oct. 2006	Taishan Yu Chinese Academy of Social Sciences	A Study of the History of the Relationship Between the Western and Eastern Han, Wei, Jin, Northern and Southern Dynasties and the Western Regions	167
174	Nov. 2006	Mariko Namba Walter	Sogdians and Buddhism	65

Number	Date	Author	Title	Pages
175	Dec. 2006	Zhou Jixu Center for East Asian Studies, University of Pennsylvania; Chinese Department, Sichuan Normal University	The Rise of Agricultural Civilization in China: The Disparity between Archeological Discovery and the Documentary Record and Its Explanation	38
176	May 2007	Eric Henry University of North Carolina	The Submerged History of Yuè	36
177	Aug. 2007	Beverley Davis	Timeline of the Development of the Horse	186